

Annotated Bibliography

<http://www.samren.org>

The following annotated bibliography (from no. 1 to 40) has been provided by Rashid Memon of Collective for Social Science Research, Pakistan.

1) Massey et al (1993), "Theories of International Migration: A review and Appraisal", *Population and Development Review* 19(3): [431-464]

This article reviews the basic theories that have been put forward to explain the factors that affect the decision to migrate and can be divided into five categories. Neo Classical Macro theory postulated by Lewis in (1954) looks at wage differentials across countries/cities. The focus is on geographic differences in the labour market only (and not other markets). Abolition of wage differentials are posited to stop migratory flows.

The extension to the neo classical theory by Todaro (1969) looks at the role of expected wages rather than absolute wages. The potential migrant decides to migrate based on the expected value of net future earnings. Since *expected* returns matter, social networks (to reduce cost of migration), personal characteristics (to increase probability of getting a job) also have a bearing on the migration decision. Governments can affect migration by influencing expected wage differentials rather than absolute differentials.

Stark and Bloom (1985) shift focus from the individual and regard the household as the decision making entity. In the absence of markets that allow a household to spread risk, a household sends of a member to another place to work, presumably where earnings are negatively correlated, if not uncorrelated. This brings to light the role of risk sharing markets – credit, insurance, unemployment and futures markets, and underscore the futility of targeting labour markets only to mitigate migration. (this theory is known as the new economics of migration)

The Dual Market Theory suggests that international migration stems from the intrinsic labour demands of modern industrial societies i.e. is essentially demand based and not supply based.. Wage differentials are therefore unimportant. Migration can only be reduced by changing the structure of economic organisation.

World Systems Theory puts the dual market theory on a higher plane, arguing that the penetration of capitalist economic relations into non-capitalist societies (through multinationals) disrupts traditional economic relations and creates a mobile population prone to migrating. Wage differential again have little to do with migration. More important is the structure of the global economy.

2) Gopinathan, Nair, (1989) "Incidence, Impact And Implications Of Migration To The Middle East From Kerala" *In To The Gulf And Back-Studies On The Economic Impact Of Asian Labour Migration*. Edited By Rashid Amjad. ILO Publications, New Delhi

This study looks at the impact of remittances on the economic growth rate of one of India's states (Kerala). The author does not find any significant impact on employment rates, growth in the agricultural sector or the rate of industrialisation. The author does find evidence for changing patterns of consumption; this, together

with a growing construction industry are identified as the main cause 'outflow' of Gulf remittances into other regions of India. This is presumably the reason why no significant impact was observed on economic growth.

3) Radhakrishnan, C. and Ibrahim, P. (1981) "Emigration, Inward Remittances And Economic Development" *Man Power Journal, New Delhi 16(4): [15-52]*

Focusing on Kerala (India) this article looks at the magnitude of remittances and its utilisation as well as the socio-economic conditions of the migrants (in India as well as the Gulf). The authors identify migrants as relatively low skilled labour. Emigration of this class of workers is hypothesised to have two effects. Firstly, given the unemployment rate in Kerala, emigration allows diffusion of social tension (caused by a large number of unemployed). Secondly, given the composition of emigrants, no evidence of brain-drain is found. No serious repercussions are therefore expected on the economic growth of the State.

4) Hadi, Abdullahel, (1999) "Overseas Migration and the Well-being of Those Left Behind in Rural Bangladesh". *Asia-Pacific population journal 14(1): [43-58]*

This study looks at 6 economic well being indicators: ability to save money, land holdings, investment in houses, access to electricity and debt repayment. The dependent variables used in the econometric methodology are 1) duration of exposure, 2) "intensity" of migration, given by number of migrants within a family and 3) migration to western countries verses less developed countries. Using data for 70 villages located in 10 regions of rural Bangladesh, the author finds that having controlled for personal characteristics such as education, occupation, access to credit and wealth:

- 1) duration of migration significantly and positively affects four out of six welfare outcomes. Those not being affected were ability to save money and ability to invest in housing.
- 2) Intensity of migration significantly and positively affects all six outcomes.
- 3) Migration to western countries has a stronger impact on the outcomes compared with the impact of migration to less developed countries (having controlled for the amount of remittances). The author attributes this to the chances of having a better earning are higher in western countries.

5) Russel, S.S., and Teitelbaum, M.S., (1992) "International Migration and International Trade", *World Discussion Papers, # 160*

This research categorises different types of international migration as well as issues and trends in the associated movement of remittances. The most important contribution however is in the discussion on the extent to which trade, aid and development affect future migration flows and the role of migration in the trade of services.

6) Sarmad, K., (1985) *Pakistani Migration to the Middle East Countries, Islamabad*

Admitting that data considerations preclude exact estimation of the impact of migration on Pakistan's economic growth, the author nevertheless argues that the

impact of migration is far from being entirely beneficial. A comparison of social and private rates of returns confirms the presence of brain drain and its deleterious effects on overall productivity. The impact on household welfare (households of migrants) in terms of income has however been substantial. The paper also concludes that although remittances have provided a significant amount of foreign exchange, the growth in consumerism and the inadequate incentives to remit are increasing the divergence between the social and the private gain from migration.

7) Lakha, S., (1992) " The Internationalisation of Indian Computer Professionals", *South Asia, Journal of South Asian Studies*, 15(2): [93-114]

This paper considers the various explanations of migration from India and considers whether this migration can be considered to be contributing to brain drain. The author concludes that traditional neo-classical theory does not provide a complete picture of the determinants of migration. While income differentials are important in the migration decision, developed countries' labour market structure is not only an important determinant of migration but also an important determinant of *who* migrates. The author draws evidence of brain drain from the migration of *highly skilled* and *experienced* professionals in the Indian IT industry. He argues that the IT industry in India was not characterised by an excess supply of professionals and more importantly, the most qualified people leaving for other countries there was a significant brain drain from the country. The integration of the Indian IT industry with global giants facilitated this movement.

8) Hassan, M.K., (1988) "The Immigration of Third World Scientists and Engineers to the United States: Theoretical, Empirical and Policy Evaluations", *Pakistan Journal of Applied Economics* 7(1): [43-58]

The author stresses the incompleteness of 'push factors' in explaining the migration decision for 15 developing countries (including Pakistan and India). Estimating a system of demand and supply equations, the author emphasises that although domestic conditions regarding opportunities, bureaucratic hurdles and income differentials were important, demand side characteristics were more important determinants of migration. Moreover, these factors determined the characteristics of those who migrated i.e. those who are most qualified. Based on this discussion the author confirms the existence of brain drain.

9) Khadria, B., (1999) "The Migration of Knowledge Workers: Second Generation Effects of India's Brain drain". Chapters 5: [139-162] and 7: [196-217]. Sage Publications, New Delhi.

Chapter 5 discusses the various channels, monetary and non-monetary, through which the sending country can benefit from migrants. Using Indian statistics, the author establishes that remittances had been able to cover 40% of the trade deficit and more than the entire debt burden in earlier years. This contribution has however been declining over the years and is mainly due to the decline of remittances from the developed countries, specifically the migration of entire families to the US.

Repatriable deposits have also declined over the years and in recent years have turned into outflows. The author attributes this to the migration of high income people to the US and the preferences for keeping their *large* deposits in developed countries.

The non resident Indians (NRIs) could also not help in transferring technology to India due to ethnocentricity in MNC s and also due to the restricted regime of technology transfer to the developing countries under the multilateral framework.

In conclusion, although NRIs have improved their own living standards quite a bit, there has been no trickle down to India itself.

10) Nayyar, D., (1994) "Migration, Remittances and Capital Flows"

11) Shah, N.M., (1994), "An Overview of Present and Future Emigration Dynamics in South Asia", *International Migration* 32(2): [217-68]

This paper attempts to outline some of the major determinants of migration flows for Bangladesh, India, Pakistan and Sri Lanka. The impact of migration on sending countries at the family and the national level is also discussed. The author finds that in the post 1970s era, most of the migration has been towards the Middle East in response to the oil boom. Only a minority of migrants are professionals, which is in line with the labour requirements of the Middle East (at least from South Asia). At the family level, wage differentials seem to playing the most important role in the decision to migrate. At the national level, the most important determinants are labour market conditions in both sending and host countries. The analysis shows that the countries have very different quality of living as revealed by the HDIs but have nevertheless seen high rates of emigration. This is consistent with the approach that labour market conditions are primary determinants of migration. The author also suggests that networks facilitate movement and in due course becomes a cause of migration itself, a finding which is consistent with the cumulative causation theory. Aggressive policy in Sri Lanka and Bangladesh has helped migrants to move, while policy makers in India and Pakistan are not enthusiastic, though do look upon emigration favourably.

On the impact side, the data suggests that foreign employment alleviated the unemployment situation especially in Kerala (India). The major reason for this is that return migrants did not want to join low paid jobs to save their pride. The author finds no evidence of brain drain and considers emigration a safety valve to supply pressures generated by population and labour force growth.

12) Nayyar, D., (1989), "International Labour Migration from India: A Macro-Economic Analysis" in *To The Gulf and Back ed Amjad, R.* pp[95-130] International Labour Organisation.

The paper distinguishes between two waves of migration, the first one beginning in the 1950s ending in the 70s involved a movement of persons with technical skills and professional expertise to industrialised countries. The second wave was concerned with the oil boom in the Middle East and involved the movement of unskilled workers and semi -skilled workers in manual or clerical activities. More important is probably the temporary migration status of the latter, a feature that has important implications for remittances (the permanent migrants settle down with families and send no remittances).

The author identifies that although remittances over the years (1950s on wards) financed significant chunk of the trade deficit, a good proportion of the remittances entered the country through illegal channels. The author puts the blame on a stringent regime of import restrictions and exchange controls. The second, perhaps

more important trend in remittances is the dramatic increase in remittances following the second wave of migration. This has been attributed to favourable policy changes such as foreign exchange liberalisation and simplification of banking procedures. The exact macro economic impact of the remittances is not known since the figures for balance of payments are not available.

Refutes the presence of brain drain for the following reasons: Some of the migrants (especially unskilled) would be unemployed before migrating. For the skilled labour who would probably have been employed before migrating, the excess labour in India would take over their jobs thus increasing welfare of both categories. Return migration however might complicate things and nullify this welfare effect.

13) Kazi, S., (1989) "Domestic Impact of Overseas Migration: Pakistan" in *To The Gulf and Back ed Amjad, R.pp[167-196]*, International Labour Organisation.

14) Burney, N., "A macro economic analysis of the Impact of Workers' remittances on Pakistan's Economy" in *To The Gulf and Back ed Amjad, R.pp[167-196]*, International Labour Organisation.

The paper attempts to gauge the impact of remittances on Pakistan's GNP growth, private consumption, savings, private investment and balance of payments. It establishes the marginal propensity to consume out of remittances at 0.85. During the 1970s and 1980s, current account deficit has dropped; remittances also helped reduce the external debt, improved debt servicing ability and decreased the need for additional foreign loans.

15) Rodrigo, C., and Jeyatissa, R.A, (1989), "Maximising Benefits from Labour Migration: Sri Lanka", in *To The Gulf and Back ed Amjad, R, pp[255-303]*, International Labour Organisation.

This study looks at the dimensions of migration but concentrates on the labour market impact of withdrawal and re-entry.

The authors points out that in contrast to the pattern in neighbouring countries, half or more of the outflow is female. Analysis by occupation yields a skewed pattern of distribution and migration involved withdrawal in certain skilled and higher level categories in numbers that cannot be overlooked and labour shortages were felt in dentistry, medical and veterinary care.

Since exact figures for remittances are not available, the authors use two methods of calculating remittances from the national income accounts. From their estimates, they find that the housemaids and skilled males contributed 81% of the total money transferred. while high level manpower accounted for only 3% of the aggregate figure although an individual in this category remitted an average of over six times that of a housemaid.

Impact on output: A high withdrawl of labour from the rice plantations is reflctd in the stagnation of output in the sector prior to 1976 but recorded a substantial expansion after that. This could have been due to the higher mechanisation which occurred in this period but no relationship can be established between mechanisation and migration. In both the output and the services sectors however, no noticeable

variation was felt. Excess labour supply in production has probably prevented any labour shortages and therefore output declines.

Contradictory to what the authors said earlier regarding brain drain, they mention complications arising from legislation of private practice for State sector professionals has which facilitated a more efficient use of the limited supply of doctors. They nevertheless highlight that in the case of doctors, 75% of the annual addition to doctors was leaving.

Discussing return of migrants, which is substantial since migration to the Middle east is strictly temporary, the author notes that the participation rate of return migrants falls below the 100% rate prior to migration. To the extent that returnees are staying out voluntarily, there is less pressure on the market, but this implies a decline in savings (investible funds) as it funds consumption.

Sri Lanka has seen a substantial expansion in the sectors which provided the most migrants and lots of vocational training centres have sprung up. A similar phenomenon is witnessed for medical colleges.

Wages have seen an increase in the years 1977-1985 but the increase in 1981-85 just compensated workers for the increase in the consumers price index. On the remittance side, migration has helped contribute up to 29% of the Gross National Savings on average. Utilisation of these remittances is dominated by consumption purposes as 40-55% of remittances are sent back as maintenance allowance and 28.8 % of the this component has leaked out due to imports. 25 % and 20% of the investment, when it is made is directed to house building and land acquisition, and vehicle purchase respectively and only 23 is invested in businesses. Additions to output due to this investment have been estimated at Rs298 million (pg 279, % of GDP not given). In this regard, the author notes that the major items of remittance financed expenditure (such as real estate) have had their multiplier effects concentrated within the region and inter district flows in this regard seem to be limited. (In this case analysis should look at wage and output fluctuations at the district level rather than at the national level).

Remittances have also assured viability of external balance of payments system and has helped Sri Lanka avoid falling in to a debt trap in the post 1979 period. Nevertheless the author concludes that remittances as yet do not constitute a source of revenue to the state in any significant sense and the only contribution seems to be airport tax and passport.

At the distributional front, the authors note some upward class mobility due to remittances which have contributed somewhat to moderate the widening distributional disparities at the national level.

16) Shahnaz, K., (1986), "Impact of Male Emigration on The Role of Rural Women in the Kohat District", *publication no. 175*, Institute of Development Studies, N.W.F.P. Agricultural University, Peshawar, Pakistan

The author surveys a village of the Kohat District in Pakistan. She attributes the decision to migrate to the 'inhospitable economic environment in that part of the country compared to other parts of Pakistan' and to the fact that working abroad alleviates a family's social status. The author discovers that the huge out flux of people (almost 99% of the households had experienced migration in the last 25

years) had created a shortage of labour in the agricultural and services sectors (the former being the predominant activity before migration). This shortage was being filled by afghan refugees and self cultivating households were moving towards tenancy. Overall the agricultural output had declined and grain was moving in from the neighbouring province of Punjab.

The author notices that remittances, 92.4 % of which she estimates are being sent through informal channels have increased the migrants' households' standard of living. The large amount of this money has however been spend on construction of houses, purchasing of land, transport and jewellery. (This increasing trend in buying land may further decrease output) but warns that remittances might not have a significant role in sustained economic growth of the country.

Within the household the role of the woman (in the absence of the man) has increased. Notably the decision of marriage is no longer a male dominated activity and women's role in the decision making process is increasing steadily. The author also observes an increased use of contraception but this is probably due to the fact that there was no family planning advice available in the village earlier.

17) Mahmud, W., "The impact of Overseas Labour Migration on the Bangladesh Economy: A Macro-Economic Perspective". in To the Gulf and Back

- Has tried to reconcile the data problems by looking at various available estimates of migration related variables.
- Outflow increased rapidly up to 1980s and then stabilised. This is attributed to the lack of demand in the Middle East.
- Early migration took place in the 50s and the 60s. Migrants took advantage of the British Immigration Act, which provided issuing of employment vouchers to overseas workers. By the 70s this flow had virtually stopped because of the enforcement of stricter immigration laws by the UK.
- The flow since the mid 70s has predominantly been a ME phenomenon
- As can be seen from Table 3, almost half of the migrants have been unskilled. Over the years, there has been a decline in the share of the professionals while no of skilled and unskilled has increased. (It might be important to note here that the share of the professionals might have plummeted because of the sheer volume of unskilled labour migration to the middle east in the 1980s and that this percentage might still be a very high number- high enough to be considered brain drain)
- The level of remittance flows is determined by many factors such as the size and skill composition of the stock of migrants, their wages and rates of savings.
- Based on information from two surveys, Mahmud estimates that 70 to 80 % of cash earnings is saved abroad.
- Does not consider remittances to be transferred through illegal channels.
- The decline in remittances from 1984 onwards may reflect the sharp fall in the nominal dollar value of wages in the ME, but part may be due to holding back savings abroad and/or due to increased usage of black channels.
- The remittance boom and its recent decline is essentially a consequence of the rise and fall in oil prices.
- Stresses the importance of the forex market in encouraging remittances, in particular the speed and reliability of the remittance transfer channels. Expects that the banking sector must have played an important role.

- Remittances are four to five times pre migration incomes on average. For professionals it can be up to 18 times the pre-migration income.
- Income differentials would have been decreased due to falling wages in the ME
- Migrants are drawn from a more affluent background compared to other workers in the same skill category suggesting the effect of the costs of migration.
- Survey studies reveal that remittance money is not squandered on frivolous consumption and that households save on average 50% of income including current remittances. The control sample, containing houses with the same income but no remittances had savings rates of 1.8% to 4.2%. Expenditure on consumer durables is however included in savings.
- High unemployment prevails among return migrants. This could imply to some extent that they have been replaced by previously unemployed people and could also reflect the time lag involved in getting employed.
- Viz return migrants, decreased earnings and high standards of living may suggest that people are dis-saving from accumulated remittances.
- At the economy level, the author distinguishes between inflationary pressure and expansionary effect arising out of migrant household's expenditure out of remittances. The author cites another study on Chittagong and Sylhet (pg 85) which found higher employment in certain service sectors and also higher prices in high migrant sending areas. The non migrants however, the author explains have been more than compensated for the higher prices through higher employment. Proof of labour inflow into these areas is also found.
- Upward pressure on urban housing (by buying urban land) can also be seen
- Home construction: usually does not lead to any positive externality in the way of contributing to the growth of employment and labour productivity in the economy except being a source of employment in the construction phase.
- Remittance also contribute to the revenue in form of duties on remittance funded imports. (figures not available)

18) Malik, S, and Sarwar, N., (1993), "Some Tests for Differences in Consumption Patterns: The impact of Remittances Using Household Income and Expenditure survey Data of Pakistan 1987-88" *The Pakistan Development Review* 32(4): [699-711]

This paper looks at whether household expenditure patterns with and without remittances are comparable across regions (rural/urban) in the four provinces of Pakistan. The authors find that with the onset of remittances, the expenditure patterns are affected in an appreciable way both at the margin and on average. It is found that contrary to popular belief, households receiving international remittances have a lower propensity to spend on consumer goods and that marginal expenditure on consumer goods is higher for urban households. This suggests that migrant households are more thrifty and do not have the relatively lavish consumption expenditures that they are conjectured in the popular literature to have.

19) Amjad, R., (1986) "Impact of Worker' Remittances from The Middle East on Pakistan's Economy: Some selected Issues" *The Pakistan Development Review* 25(4) [757-785]

The paper, on the basis of available data relates the use of remittances by the migrant household to the overall development of the economy.

The author considers migration to be a factor that has dramatically affected the domestic employment situation and the balance of payments position. The slowing down in economic activity in the major labour receiving countries together with increased competition from other labour exporting countries has led to a decline in the flow of migrants.

At the national level, it is pointed out that remittances supplement the foreign exchange resources available to the economy and so reduces the balance of payments constraint and the corresponding domestic resources can be generated to supplement domestic investment or consumption. Remittances from the middle east increased from 3.16% (of GDP) to 9.39% in 1982-83 but declined to 7.0% (still substantial) in 1985-86.

- At their peak, remittances from the ME contributed as much as 75% to the overall balance of trade and financed 36% of the merchandise imports and non factor payments.
- Despite the substantial increase in the level of imports made possible by remittances there is no significant change in the level of investments as a percentage of GNP.
- While gross domestic savings declined sharply during 1977-78 to 1985-8, the level of gross national savings increased significantly and was double the saving rate during the period. This reflects that the increase in workers' remittances decreased dependence on foreign borrowing to finance total investment from 45.3% in the first half of the 60s to 12.5% from 1970-71 to 1976-77

At the local economy level, growth of output in certain sectors (small-scale manufacturing, construction, transport and communication and whole sale and trade) was significantly affected by the increased demand generated remittances. An increase in the number of manufacturing units was specially prominent in the plastic industry (tableware). The residential construction boom gave rise to related industries such as electric cables and fittings, sanitary ware and metal fixtures. The author estimates growth in the small scale industry to be at almost 10 % and 8% in construction, an increase of 30 % over the same period in the last decade. (It must be mentioned here that the increase in growth rate continued even when remittances began to decrease. This could either be due to the fact that remittances were being channelled through informal means or that factors other than remittances were affecting growth)

Overall, as a percentage of private gross fixed capital formation in small-scale manufacturing and services, the contribution of remittances are as high as 53.5% and 71.3 % respectively.

At the household level, a major chunk of remittances is allocated to consumption while 18% is invested in Pakistan and 1.2% is spent on investment abroad.

20) Azam. F., (1991)"Emigration Dynamics in Pakistan", *Regional development Dialogue.* , 12,no.3 (1991): [729-762]

The author looks at characteristics of the labourers migrating to the middle east and to the effects of migration at the local economy and household level. The author finds that migrants are not drawn from the poorest sections of society but from the lower middle income groups. Three reasons for migration are pointed out. firstly his employment status, secondly his level of earnings and thirdly the cost of migration.

Migration has caused income, and therefore consumption gains in the migrant's household but are these gains are temporary in nature. There is no evidence of substantial investment that can sustain this increased income. In particular, while the agricultural sector employs the largest proportion of the work force hardly any new techniques have been introduced to boost production and generate more employment.

The most important contribution of this paper is its documentation of Pakistan's emigration policy over the years. The author points out that while the governments' policy implicitly aims at maximising labour migration, it has done little to expand overseas job opportunities for migrant workers except to maintain close ties to the main countries of employment. Passport issuance has however been made easier and a series of regulations were passed in 1979 to control the functioning of recruiting agencies who were also expected to maximise manpower export. In practice however, the author discovers that many of the rules are subverted. The recruitment costs that have to be paid by the migrant for example have been 51 times higher than the officially permitted fees (around Rs. 12,241. This figure should be compared to the average earning of the typical migrant in Pakistan which amounts to Rs 782). These figures were taken from a secondary source. The author's own interviews with return migrants came to Rs.40,000

The government has also reportedly asked its legislators to nominate five persons each from their constituencies who would be sent abroad for employment. This patronage has resulted in a comprise of the quality of workers sent abroad. A managing director of the official emigration authority has reportedly been dismissed when he was unable to accommodate the nominees.

Facing increased competition from other labour sending countries and a tightening of the Middle East labour market, the government decided to waive the condition of minimum wage for skilled and unskilled workers. The condition that the employer must provide return ticket to the migrant has also been waived. In addition, many employers now sell visas to recruiting agents instead of paying them a commission. All these costs have however been passed onto the migrant.

21) Mahmood, Zafar., (1991) "Emigration and Wages in an Open Economy: Some evidence from Pakistan", *The Pakistan Development Review* 30(3): [243-262]

The paper examines the impact of emigration on the wages of both skilled and unskilled workers. Based on the estimated relative factor intensities, the author predicts that emigration of either skilled or unskilled workers from Pakistan in the long run would increase (in both nominal and real terms) but the returns to capital would decrease if Pakistan were to maintain competitiveness in the international market. This follows from the reasoning that when emigration takes place, it raises the price of labour intensive activity, which in turn raises the wages of both the skilled and the unskilled workers. Consequently the higher wages to both skilled and unskilled workers must be compensated by a reduction in the return to capital if export-oriented and import competing sectors in Pakistan are to remain internationally competitive.

Thus, emigration of any kind of workers turns income distribution in favour of labour and against capital.

This prediction is consistent with the persistently rising wages of both skilled and unskilled workers during the 1970s and 80s. (and against the predictions of the standard trade theoretical models - that migration to or from a small open economy should have no effect on the wages of factors of production)

22) Adams, R.H., (1992) "The Effects of Migration and Remittances on Inequality in Rural Pakistan" *The Pakistan Development Review* 31(4), [1189-1206]

Using a survey of 702 households, this study focuses on remittances sent home by *economic* migrants. The framework of analysis uses income equations to predict incomes with and without remittances. The results are then used to evaluate the changes in income distribution (measured by the Gini coefficient and the Theil entropy measure) that occur when internal and international remittances are excluded, compared to when they are included. A shortcoming of the study is that it only looks at the direct, first-order effects of remittances on income distribution while ignoring the second and third round effects of remittances on income distribution through wage and employment linkages.

The results imply that both internal and international remittances have a neutral impact on rural income distribution in Pakistan. After including internal remittances the Gini Coefficient rises less than 3% while the Theil measure rises by less than 9%. Including international remittances. Including international remittances raises the Gini by less than 1% and the Theil by less than 8%.

23) Burney, N., (1987) "Workers' Remittances from the Middle East and their Effect on Pakistan's Economy," *The Pakistan Development Review* 26(4) [745-763]

The study attempts to analyse the impact of remittances on the Pakistani Economy, in particular on broad economic indicators such as GNP growth, saving and balance of payments from 1969-70 to 1985-86

The author estimates that the contribution of remittances from the Middle East to GNP growth was highest during 1973-74 to 1976-77 (at 13.6%) and when remittances from the ME are taken into account, the share can go up to 24%. The contribution of remittances to GNP growth during this period is estimated at 10%. Further the author brings to notice that as the remittances declined and became negative during 1982-83 to 1985-86, the average annual growth rate of the GNP also dropped to 6.05%

Balance of Payments

The author notes that as the share of remittances from the middle east in the GNP increased from 0.7% in 1974-75 through 1985-86, the current account deficit has dropped from 10.3% to 1.3%. With a decrease in the share of remittances in GNP to 5.7% in 1985-86, the current account deficit has increased to 3.2% in the same period. the author explains that as the share of remittances from the ME in the GNP increase, the national saving rates increases and the current account deficit as a percentage of GNP decreases. This tends to accelerate the GNP growth rate and vice versa. Also, the forex available through workers' remittances has helped debt servicing and reduce the external debt burden. The latter was 52% of the total exports receipt in 1969-70 and only 8.8% 1981-82.

24) Shah, Nasra, (Emigration Dynamics from and within South Asia)

This study is a synthesis of the determinants of migration from south asia, (India, Pakistan and Sri Lanka).

Notes that in the 1976-1993, the predominant flow of migrants was to the ME. (above 90%), a high proportion of which is absorbed by Saudi Arabia. Most of the migrants were in the non professional cadres and except for Sri Lankans, the majority was male. On their return, the author notes that the full time employment rate was lower than their pre migration rate. Most had acquired new skills while abroad but were unable to use them in their home country. Their investments did not create appreciable new employment either one reason of which could be indifference of the government to channel these resources. The author also points out something that contradicts other papers: that the investment and business of many returnees failed to generate enough income to sustain the household and these circumstances had decided many workers to seek employment abroad again.

Macro Level Determinants: For Sri Lanka, the author notes that a major shift in development strategy in 1977 from import substitution to export oriented growth reduced dependence on traditional primary commodity exports which could have lead people engaged in these activities to migrate. In Bangladesh declining real wages could be the main culprit and in Pakistan, the sluggishness of the agricultural sector (in certain years only) which employs the majority of the labour could be boosting migration. The author also notes that labour was in excess in the sending countries so there was no shortage of skills ex-post. This however did not hold for Sri Lankan skilled workers in light engineering, electricity, construction and telecommunication sectors since there was not a surplus in these sectors and the country suffered a shortage.

Community, Family and Individual Decision making: In all cases, the reasons for migrating were economic: In Bangladesh, 91 % of the respondents of a survey said they wanted to increase their incomes, while 45% of an Indian sample said that they migrated for employment. Pakistan and Sri Lanka followed suit. It is difficult to say whether it was a credit market failure or a labour market failure that induced migration. Judging from desired income increases and employment it could be a labour market failure. Judging from the fact that remittances were used to construct houses and acquire land, it could very well be a credit market failure. It would probably not be inappropriate to say failures in both markets were responsible.

Discussing facilitation of migration, the author notes that networks are important for migration for all countries.

Channels of migration as predicted by the institutional theory are responsible for sending a good proportion of the migrants, although the role of government regulated formal channels is much less than informal channels.

Sending Country Policies: While Sri Lanka and Bangladesh have been actively promoting migration and have produced colourful brochures highlighting their human resources, India and Pakistan have been less enthusiastic. In Sri Lanka, the government went as far as organising employment promotion tours to Lebanon, Greece, Cyprus and Italy and has planned for training programs to enhance the human capital of their labourers. Furthermore, the government also provides a 90

day guarantee on all workers it sends abroad for employment. this guarantee entitles an employer to call for a replacement of any worker who has been found unfit. Pakistan and India have however not been very active except for withdrawing the minimum wage conditions and trying to minimize the costs of migration. Implementation of the latter however is a different issue, not explored by the author.

Receiving country policies have reflected their own labour requirements and have dealt with unwanted labour severely. Japan has a fine of 200,000 yen and 3 year imprisonment fine, Malaysia levies different levels of taxes on employers importing labour from different skill levels while the Middle East have also used imprisonment to discourage illegal immigration. (To see the relative importance of sending/receiving countries, it would be necessary to match flows with introduction of new policy regimes, which the author does not do.)

Consequences of emigration: Refers to different sources (discussed within this bibliography) on macro economic impact so I will not discuss them here.

25) Sharma, H.L., "A Study of Relationship Between Migration and Fertility" *Demography India* 21(1): [51-57]

Using data from a sample survey (details not provided), the study uses the open birth interval (OBI) as a fertility index to look at the relationship between fertility and migration. Estimation yields that while probability of conception in a unit of time (in this case 1 month) is 0.135 for a migrant, it is only 0.048 for a non-migrant. The author attributes this result to the presumably high rate of coition of migrated couples whenever male partners visit their households. The author also points out that the level of fecundity of migrated couples is close to that reported for couples in developed countries.

26) Subedi, B.P., (1991) International Migration in Nepal: Towards an Analytical Framework, *Nepalese Studies* 18(1), 83-102

Using secondary data, this paper examines emigration from the Hill areas of Nepal and Immigration to the Tarai region (both being international).

The author refutes Todaro's wage differential theory. Search for arable land rather has been the decisive factor. This view is reflected in the migration of people from the hill areas in Nepal to the sparsely populated areas of India (Assam, Kangra valley and West Bengal). Differences in land prices have further boosted movement of agricultural workers. For non-agricultural workers on the other hand, employment opportunities have played the major role.

The author also analyses 'affinity' variables, citing culture, religion language kinship networks, and similarities in physical habitat to be important as well. It is difficult however to see whether these factors have been determinants of migration or have merely facilitated it.

27) Gunatilleke, G., (), "Sri Lanka", in *Migration to the Arab world*", ed. Gunatilleke, G.,

28) Mahmood, R.A., () "Bangladesh", in *Migration to the Arab world*", ed. Gunatilleke, G.,

29) Gunatilleke, G., "Sri Lanka" in *Impact of Labour Migration on households*, ed. Gunatilleke, G

30) Rodrigo, C., (1992) "Overseas Migration From Sri Lanka: Magnitude, Patterns and Trends", *Asian Regional Exchange for New Alternatives, Asian Exchange*, 8(3/4): [41-74]

Points out two major trends of economic migration, an earlier one comprising of high skill professionals who migrated to developed countries and a later one, comprising of skilled/unskilled manpower to the ME. Among the Middle Eastern countries, Kuwait and Saudi Arabia seem to prime destinations apparently due to the high per capita income (and presumably higher wage differentials). An interesting feature of Sri Lankan migration was the concentration of female housemaids. This reduced Sri Lanka's vulnerability to economic slow down in the Middle East.

An interesting impact of migration is presented: The positions that opened up in the domestic manufacturing sector had a bias in favour of low skilled labour and female labour. The flow to the ME also had a bias towards females while in the internal market; selection process had become very political. This was conducive to an aggravation of tensions and frustrations among the male youth. The civil unrest was a manifestation

Efforts in labour absorption have however been made on both international and national fronts and the policy environment has been made conducive to foreign investment. Efforts have been made to provide incentives comparable to those in trade free zones in South and South East Asia.

On the importance of remittances, the author notes that they have accounted for up to 5.5% of the GDP in the mid 80s and currently remittances rank second only to tea and garments as source of forex (16%). Migrants have been provided incentives to bring in forex through duty free concessions for imports on a scale that varies with the duration of stay. Returned migrants can operate forex accounts for 10 years after returning and these accounts are not subject to the usual exchange rate controls. The author also points out that these inflows helped the country to maintain the viability of external payments and avoid falling into a severe external dept trap. they also helped to sustains the country's liberalised trade and exchange system of the post 1977 era.

A positive impact is also noted on consumption and income distribution since the migrants came mainly from low income households. Contribution to domestiv output and employment generation seems limited however.

The impacts on the labour market are considered a mixture of positive and negative effects. The largest group of migrants belonged to the unskilled category which is in surplus. Migration therefore increased opportunities for these people. In the more professional sectors such as doctors and engineers, the author notes significant brain drain since these people are not in excess. In dentistry for e.g. the country lost one out of every four professional coming out of school and compared to the target of a dentist per 20,000 the actual ratio stood at 1:38,000. While the imbalances have led to wage increases in some areas, other visible manifestations of the imbalance include heavy overtime bills, unfilled vacancies and downward adjustment of recruitment qualifications. In view of this, an act was passed in 1961 containing

provisions to retain services of some persons but the operation was suspended in 1974 on the recommendation of a 'brain drain committee' and the liberalisation of leave facilities to state sector employees whereby leave could be availed up to five years for working abroad has been a recent feature to encourage mobility.

As currently operative, the recruitment process is typically left to private initiative.

The author touches upon the issue of female migration but does not dwell on it longer, merely stating that women take up their traditional roles on return. The author also hints upon adverse social repercussions recorded in the form of neglected children, weakened marital bonds and broken families. Some have returned only to find their remitted, hard-earned money dissipated on wasteful consumption by the spouse and families left behind. New values acquired abroad have also in some cases created problems of adjustment to family and social environment upon return. This is essentially important in the face of a degenerating extended family system (as a result of the modernisation of the economy).

Second and third round effects of remittances are however not looked into deeply.

On wage differentials: For the 1980s as much as five to eight fold in the male manual category and the gap in higher levels is bigger. Godfrey's 30:1 ratio is however an overestimate.

A more interesting comparison may be in terms of the length of employment a prospective migrant would require at home to earn what an average two year contract overseas would yield him by wage of income. For female domestics this works out to about 15 years, and for male skilled and unskilled workers, at least 6 to 7 years. An important point to be stressed is that in these low level manpower categories, the pay packet at the prevailing local wages would have been completely taken up by current consumption of the household, leaving little or no surplus for acquiring assets or for investment as in the case of employment abroad.

Migrants have been offered (in the late 80s) a compulsory insurance against risks such as permanent disability and death in host country, but this is only for those migrating through the Foreign employment bureau.

The paper provides national unemployment rates. It would have been better to get unemployment rates among regions in order to see which areas provided most migrants.

31) Azam, F., (1991) "Labour Migration From Pakistan: Trends, Impacts and Implications. *Regional Development Dialogue*, 12(3), [53-73]

Starts off with the importance of labour migration in Pakistan – a labour force growing at a rate of 1 million people a year and unemployment rates reaching 12%. The problem is further exacerbated by expectations that the economy would not be able to expand proportionately in the near future.

Indicates that 83% of all migrants were from rural areas. (from which one might think that migration was most from the least developed provinces. The fact that only 4% of migrants hailed from Baluchistan– the poorest province does not however support this. It would therefore be important to analyse inter-regional differences to get a hold of who migrates).

Most migrants were reported to be employed before migrating and the author estimates the *income* differentials to be six times pre-migration incomes.

Considers 1981 to be the peak year of migration. (It would have been good to know what policies were being followed by the governments of both sending and receiving countries. The trends in migration also point out to the importance of monitoring issues affecting migration (wage differentials, environmental conditions, political conditions) over a period of time and matching them with trends in migration to establish the importance of various theories. It is very possible that the theory that could explain migration in the early 80s loses explanatory power over the years as different states of nature develop).

Points out Saudi Arabia as the main country of labour import. The author does not provide any explanation as to why this country was of first choice. Gunatilleke in his papers does say that the wages were highest in Saudi Arabia and Kuwait and therefore the decision. Such information is however not available for Pakistan.

Quotes that 48% of the workers had worked abroad on an employment contract. (this provides evidence against the dual labour market theory which posits that migration should occur through formal channels and not on individual initiative). The author also finds that 63% of those who did not go on a contract secured jobs through friend-relative networks. This suggests the importance of networks and could imply cumulative causation where networks became the cause of migration to that particular country. This fits in with the fact that over 1981-1987 over 99% of migrants have moved to the middle east.

A most interesting finding presented by the author is the fact that Japan had been providing working visas to 'entertainers' the majority of which happen to be female. The fact that Pakistan had imposed a ban on females migrating (following cases of sexual abuse in the ME) does not allow it to 'compete' in sending entertainers. Japan does not offer working visas to skilled/unskilled workers who constitute the majority of people migrating from Pakistan.

On the impact side, the evidence is consistent with other studies; around 61% to 65% of remittances sent back is used on consumption. and around 35%-38% were invested (29% in housing and construction).

On returning, 26% of migrants were reported to have set up businesses of their own. (21% were unemployed). At the time of the survey, most were less than one year old so not much can be said about their contribution to the economy. (the author provides an over view of the sectors that absorbed the returnees, and notes that 81% of the return migrants reported that the skills learnt during migration were not used back at home).

Points out three reasons of low rates of migration by professional:

- 1) low level of literacy
- 2) system of testing and certification not credible (especially in comparison to Thailand and Philippines)
- 3) Training in Pakistan was indifferent to the changing modern technology requirements of labour importing countries.

Moreover, large scale out migration was responsible for creating initial shortages of selected skills in the country. Subsequently both the domestic and the overseas demands provided impetus to the training of labour in those skills. (e.g. construction). With this in mind it is suggested that a careful assessment of impact of out and return migration on sectoral growth and the labour market is required to ensure return migrant absorption.

32), Gunatilleke G., (1995) "The Economic, Demographic, Socio Cultural and Political Setting for Emigration from Sri Lanka" *International Migration* 33(3/4): [667-695]

Identifies three flows. one to the Middle East, another to the Tamil Nadu in India and the third to the developed common wealth countries and the US.

Ascribes the labour migration in 1970s the demand for foreign labour in the oil exporting countries in the ME (as the main external factor) and to low incomes and employment – reaching 20% of the work force (as the main internal factor).

Migrants who found employment through the Labour department represented a very small proportion of the total and while registered agencies served many migrants, larger numbers found employment through unregistered agencies and informal networks of friends. For e.g. in 1993 foreign employment placements by licensed agencies and the Bureau totalled 48746, according to an airport survey migration was estimated to be 129000. no firm data are available however on non-economic migration especially the one to Tamil Nadu in the wake of ethnic riots. On the policy front, a coalition of socialist parties during 1956 to 1965 and 1970-1977 favoured state enterprises while those in other years favoured the market oriented approach. The post 1977 reforms in particular created conditions favourable for migration. The devaluation of the rupee and relaxation of exchange controls facilitated remittances.

Analysing the impact of migration on the labour market, the author notes that the gross migration flow is taking the equivalent of 86% of the people seeking new employment!. (pg 676). This is not however causing any shortage in the market which is reflected in the down ward movement of wages between 1978 and 1992.

A most interesting point to note is that after 1978-1982 the wages in the construction sector increased substantially thus reducing the pull of the higher wages in ME. Small number of construction workers however continued to migrate.

The large majority of migrants come from the more urbanised coastal region. It seems that globalisation which is reaching urban centres has contributed to information flows conducive to migration. The availability of regular air transport and the communication links with family members has also contributed.

On the remittance side, migrants were given incentives to remit: Forex accounts could be drawn upon without restrictions and with a realistic exchange rate, the rupee value of remittances was maintained at an attractive level to the extent that the black market shrank to negligible proportions and the savings came feely into the official account thus helping Balance of Payments.

The government also strengthened legal and administrative machinery to facilitate migration. Agencies were regulated to minimise abuse of migrants and passport procurement made simple.

33) Premi, M.K., and Mathur, M.D., "Emigration Dynamics: The Indian Context". *International Migration* 33(3/4): [627-663]

Starts by refuting the world systems theory of migration. Suggests that although the neo classical theory may be relevant to the extent of wage differentials, it could not explain migration in totality due to the collective nature of the decision making process.

Identifies the first flow of migrants to the UK and Canada, the former being driven by the labour shortage of post world war II era and the liberal provisions for immigration from within the Common wealth. This emigration was characterised by almost entirely permanent migrants, a large proportion of whom have been professionals whose skills have been perceived to be scarce or needed in the receiving countries. This was true until the early 1970s when their proportion started to decline.

Comparatively large scale migration from India however began in the mid 1970s following the oil boom in the middle east. The majority of the migrants were absorbed by Saudi Arabia. (It might be worth looking into what makes Saudi Arabia the most attractive destination and might help pinpoint the cause of migration. Similarly the fact that roughly half of the migrants originate from Kerala deserves more attention. The socio-economic characteristics of the state would have important implications in defining determinants of migration)

With regards to the characteristics of migrants, the author notes that 36% of migrants had been unemployed prior to migration.

On the issue of remittances, the author uses secondary data to point out the sharp increase in remittances received during the 'migration to ME' phase. This would probably be attributed to the temporary nature of the ME migrants. These remittances have mainly financed land acquisition, improvement in housing quality and ownership of consumer durables in migrant households.

The author points to acute unemployment as the main reasons for migration. (87.4% of migrants went due to employment while 98 % went to increase their incomes). The fact that only 36% were unemployed compared to 87.4% migrating due to employment reasons either suggests under employment or wage differential as the main cause.

Networks were also found to be important and 56% of the sample made use of the network. To the extent that networks are an indicator of private initiative this refutes the usefulness of the dual labour market theory. Interestingly, the author also points out to rising sea levels as a cause but does not dwell on it longer.

The author concludes that the state of Kerala has benefited from the migration but again does not explain in detail how.

On the role of the government, the paper limits its discussion to the surrounding countries, in particular Nepal. The 1950 treaty of Peace and Friendship between the two countries provided that the governments "agree to grant on a reciprocal basis to the nationals of one country in the territory of the other the same privileges in the matter of residence, ownership and property, participation in trade and commerce,

movement and other privileges of similar nature. However, as the flows of Indians to Nepal increased, the agreement was nullified in 1975.

34) Gopinathan, N.P.R., "India" in *Impact of Labour Migration on Households* ed. Gunatilleke, G.,

This study concentrates on the effects of migration at the household level. The study asks questions such as: Are the observed differences due to factors beyond their control or do they result from differences in their ability to manage migration? What are the factors that have led to success in maximising households-level benefits from migration?

Using a survey of 690 households the author finds that:

- among the 142 highly successful cases (where success was identified as improvement in economic and quality of life variables and intra-family and social relationships), more than 80% had secondary or higher levels of education.
- Saudi Arabia is seen as a country that produced a disproportionate number of failures.
- the occupational category with the greatest share of failures was that of unskilled workers in construction or other activities.
- Persons migrating through informal channels were very failure prone, while those whose movement was facilitated through kinship networks were found to be predominantly successful.

The author then analyses while internal factors such as the migrant's family problems etc. were to a certain extent responsible for failure, policy was as much to blame. The author alleges that the government has not done much to enforce the laws it has passed to ease the process of migration. Therefore, when accidents occur, they strike with full force.

The author identifies the need to 'earn more' as the main determinant of migration. This would imply that wage differentials were the main determinants of migration.

35) Shah, Tulsi, "Migration in Bangladesh: Its Trends and Determinants" *Demography India* 17(2): [289-309]

This paper is concerned only about internal migration. I have nevertheless included it because of the contrast it provides to international migration. The point I am trying to make is that determinants of international migration may be very different from the determinants of internal migration, thus advising which theoretical framework to use for a particular type of migration and therefore inform on policy.

The author points out demographic features in relation to the agricultural productivity of the areas as the main determinants of migration. A more interesting point is perhaps that areas with modern irrigation systems are less likely to send out migrants. (In credit market literature, presence of irrigation systems have often been used as a measure of risk in that area. It may be possible to link this with the Stark's risk market theory. This is partly supported by the fact that migration is from the poorest and the riches families. In the case of the poorest families who would be

suffering from differential access to credit migration could be in response to credit market failures).

The author also finds that young people for whom the probability of getting a job is higher tend to migrate more. (late teens, until early thirties).

The author also noted that districts with higher environmental risks were prone to more migration.

A bivariate regression analysis however does not support the above argument. Rather, income and population pressure are the notable determinants. It is not clear however why bivariate analysis was chosen over multivariate. In case there is an omitted variable bias, these estimates would not be trust worthy.

36) Mahmood, R.A, (1995), "Emigration Dynamics in Bangladesh", *International Migration* 33(3/4): [699-727]

This paper discusses issues related to migration to U.K, Middle East and North Africa. The choice of countries of selection was made keeping in mind the availability of data rather than the fact that these were the most important destinations for Bangladeshi migrants.

This paper provides an interesting evidence for the cumulative causation theory for the earlier migration 'spree' to the U.K. To quote " The networks that had been established [...] triggered large scale migration from Bangladesh especially through Employment Vouchers issued by the British Labour Department following the promulgation of the first Immigration Act of 1966. Migration continued until it was stopped in 1973. This is also direct evidence for the dual market theory which predicts migration due to demand in developed countries. The author also notes that given the cultural linkages with Bangladeshis living in the U.K the flow can be expected to continue although at a much lower level.

The age profile (40% of migrants from Chittagong to the Middle east were under 25 years of age) suggests not only young people's interests in international migration but also the interest of the receiving countries in recruiting young people to do the tedious menial jobs that the indigenous young do not want to take. (this is consistent with all destinations) The author also finds that given the high costs of migration dictates that only people from the relatively well off families migrate suggesting a worsening inequality situation.

The government seems to have been quite active in promoting migration especially in the ME phase. A separate institute (Bangladesh Bureau of Manpower Employment and Training) was established in 1976 to organise and monitor migration and bilateral agreements were negotiated with labour importing countries to supply Bangladeshi workers. This official channel has however been of minimal importance in sending migrants who presumably have taken private initiative to migrate. Private institutions have however cropped up and these were dominant in the 1977-1981 after which their share declined. This suggests that the dual labour market theory does explain migration in the initial periods after which private initiative takes over (presumably due to networking). The author believes that within the country those coming from Chittagong have the biggest kinship network in the ME and therefore do not rely on private institutions while others do.

Occupation structure is as usual– a majority of unskilled and semi skilled workers (for all destinations).

The author concludes that the major reason for the upward trend in emigration from Bangladesh has been the prevalence of exceeds demand for labour whether explicit or implicit. (i.e. supporting the Dual Market theory)

37) Mahmood, R.A, “Bangladesh Returned Migrants from the Middle East: Process, Achievement and Adjustment” in

38) Lal, V.K, (2000), “Issues of Internal and International Migration in Tarai Region of Nepal”, *The Economic Journal of Nepal* 23(1): [7-13]

Notes that the most significant migratory flows are from hill regions to low lands (tarai) and that four out of five migrants had migrated to the tarai which seems to be the destination of migrants from within and outside Nepal (India). An interesting feature is that Nepalese migrants are never permanent migrants and they tend to go back their place of origin. An exception is the permanent migration of a certain community which migrated to India as bonded labour. Otherwise, movements from the Tarai to India seem to be commanded by wage differentials.

Regarding the impact of migration on the Tarai region, the author finds that migrants cultivated fallow land thus leaving little for pasture land. Other environmental resources such as fuel wood are also effected. To the extent that jobs depended on selling fuel wood and other resources, unemployment has increased. The author also notes that due to the stress on the environment, there has been shortage of rainfall, decline in fertility of soil and desertification of some part of the tarai.

Movements from India to the Tarai have been somewhat regulated in recent times when only citizens of Nepal could buy/construct a house in Nepal.

39) Roy, S.G., and Datta, P., “Nepali Migration to West Bengal”, *Demography India*, 24(2), [211-223]

The study provides a brief over view of the determinants of migration and the characteristics of those who do. Discussion of migration is limited to internal (mountain to low-land) and international migration to India’s state of West Bengal.

Attributes the choice of destination (Darjeeling and Jalpaiguri districts) to the low costs associated with migrating there and holds distance accountable for much of the variation in migration. The second reason (probably more important) is the existence of a relative/ friend network in these districts. The only case where distance did not matter was migration to Calcutta where enhanced economic opportunities, communication facilities (which has reduced costs of migration) and family networks have facilitated migration. (This could point out to the importance of networks over migrating costs. It could also support the neo-classical micro theory to the extent that wages could be high in Calcutta than Darjeeling. Lack of data however does not permit conformation of this hypothesis)

The author goes on to attribute the decision to migrate to economic reasons and labour market conditions are the main problem. (not wages per se, but lack of employment). An important push factor has also been the decreasing per capita availability of food between 1960-70 – food production has been unable to keep up

with increasing population due to infrastructural and technological underdevelopment. Another piece of evidence for the neo classical theory is the fact that economic downturn in areas of destination has to a certain extent reversed the flow of migrants to the extent that they are returning.

40) Muinul Islam *et al*, (1987) "Overseas migration from rural Bangladesh: a micro study" University Of Chittagong: chapter VI: Summary and Conclusion

Admits that the inflow of remittances from migration of the late seventies brought more forex than jute in the eighties, but underlines the importance of non economic effects of migration.

Using a survey of four Bangladeshi communities of two main migrant areas –Sylhet and Chittagong, the author notes that 63% of migrants from Chittagong came from land less or marginally landed households, while the opposite was the case for those from Sylhet. This is an interesting point when the fact that most of the migration from Sylhet was to the United Kingdom while that from Chittagong was totally to the Middle East, is considered. Even more interesting is the point is that migrants from both communities were unskilled or semi skilled. (Both would be earning low wages in the countries of destination but it could well be that income differentials determine not only migration but the destination of migration. Those from Sylhet probably had higher incomes due to their land and needed a higher wage (presuming wages in U.K are higher than wages in the Middle East) to migrate.)

On the economic side, the author finds that of the remittances sent back (90% of both communities send back remittances), savings are largely invested in land and property as a result of which prices of land have sky rocketed.

The effect on agricultural productivity is not conclusive. Although the general level of infrastructure has improved in migrant sending areas, migrants' land holdings are scattered all over which does not allow for economies of scale. Out migration has also reduced the family supply of labour (also because those left behind do not want to engage in agriculture ex-post) and the family has to rely on non-migrant households. This is reflected in the rising (doubling) of agricultural wages, a rise in farm level prices of agricultural products and a fall in the variety of agricultural products. In Sylhet in particular, a change in institutions – from self cultivation to share cropping and tenancy has been witnessed. A more in-depth study is needed to gauge the extent of changing institutions and to explore the effect of this change on agricultural productivity.

An interesting point brought forward is that apart from land acquisition, savings are spent on acquiring transport services such as rickshaws and buses. This could provide justification to the credit market hypothesis of migration. (Stark).

Apparently, banks have also been attracted to the districts in question, which is contradictory in the sense that people are spending money on land and transport acquisition. Savings in cash would probably be very low.

On the socio-demographic side, a most interesting phenomenon is the preference for a smaller number of children in those migrating towards the UK compared to those migrating to the ME. Schooling for children has also increased (presumably because the family has more money). The author notes that religious fervour has also

decreased in migrants which could be a reason why migrants and non migrant households do not intermarry.

The author also points out that illiteracy is lower among migrants than non migrants which could point out to the 'self selection' phenomenon, in which case it would be hard to associate out the above socio cultural changes to migration per se.

The following annotated bibliography has been taken from Susie Jolly, 2003, 'Gender and Migration in Asia: overview and annotated bibliography', paper presented at the Regional Conference on Migration, Development and Pro-Poor Policy Choices in Asia, jointly organised by the Refugee and Migratory Movements Research Unit, and the Department for International Development, UK, in Dhaka on 22-24 June 2003.

41. Chant, Sylvia (ed), 1992. *Gender and migration in developing countries*, London: Belhaven Press.

One of the first systematic attempts to explore the causes, nature and consequences of gender-selective population movement in a range of developing countries. Particular attention is paid to women's experiences as migrants and /or as members of households from which men migrate. Case studies from Latin America, the Caribbean, Africa, and Asia illustrate the diversity of gender-selective migration, and also the similarities, in particular the constraints on movement of low-income women. The book concludes that there are common as well as divergent gender patterns in migration from and within developing countries.

Lessons for policy: Men migrating and women being left behind may be a functional livelihood strategy for some households, but may also exacerbate inequalities and leave women with increased vulnerability, stress and impoverishment. The problem, however, is not gender selective migration in itself, but the inequality that underlies it. This needs to be addressed through: national strategies to raise women's status; gender aware agrarian reform programmes to enhance women's role in agriculture; reproductive support for rural women; access to work for women in rural and urban areas through job creation, enforcement of equal opportunities, and positive discrimination. Better data and research on gender and migration is also needed (adapted from Sweetman, 1995, p63).

42. Chantavich, Supang, (ed), 2001. *Female Labour Migration in South-East Asia: Change and Continuity*, Bangkok: Asian Research Centre for Migration.

This study is based on interviews with 387 women returnees, in Indonesia, Philippines, Thailand and Yunnan province in China. They had returned from international labour migration, mostly as domestic helpers, caregivers, entertainers and sex workers, and a smaller proportion as workers in manufacturing or agriculture. Those from Yunnan were all irregular, and others included both irregular and regular migrants. Many were married with children, and in most cases husbands would help with housework during their absence. All the female workers earned some income while away, and many sent remittances to parents or other family members. Some women experienced violence and/or sexual harassment while away. Upon return, the women faced varying situations. Some reintegrated into agricultural or service work or started their own businesses. Others found re-integration difficult

into the economy, family or culture, and wanted to re-migrate. The Thai, Filipino and Chinese women generally reported increased self-confidence and independence after return. Based on the study, policy recommendations are made including: better protection of vulnerable female migrants; a gender sensitive reintegration programme; an information and communication campaign to facilitate links between female migrants and their families, increasing information to women about regular migration channels, and discouraging irregular migration by increasing awareness of the risks involved.

43. Key points from 'Gender, Migration and Governance in Asia', 12 December, 2002. A two day conference on *Gender, Migration and Governance in Asia*, held at the Australian National University <<http://media.uow.edu.au/media/2002/feminine.html>> (accessed 07.01.03)

Labour migration in Asia became increasingly feminised during the 1990s, though labour market segregation continued. The following policy recommendations are made: transnational trans-ethnic advocacy networks should be established, to work on common issues across boundaries of nationality; government needs to be involved at local, state/province, national and international levels; regional cooperation should take place to facilitate international migration (as in Europe); accurate information should be disseminated about realities of migrant experiences and their contributions to the local economy.

44. Lim, Lean Lim and Oishi, Nana, 1996. 'International Labour Migration of Asian Women: Distinctive Characteristics and Policy Concerns' in *Asian and Pacific Migration Journal*, Vol. 5, No. 1.

Migration offers potential for both economic opportunity and exploitation. Women migrants are doubly marginalised not only by race/anti-migrant prejudice but also by gender discrimination. In line with stereotyped expectations, Asian female migrants are highly concentrated in women-dominated occupations, including domestic work and entertainment/sex work, hotels, assembly lines. This can leave them vulnerable, especially where working in isolated situations (eg. domestic work), or in areas not covered by host country's labour laws and social security. Other problems include: de-skilling and loss of status through migration; lack of safe efficient channels to remit earnings; difficulties in reintegration upon return. Asian countries, both sending and receiving, have experimented with a number of gender selective and gender sensitive migration policies and programmes. Recent actions on the part of Asian women migrants themselves and NGOs in sending and receiving countries, complements government programmes. Some governments promote out migration, for example through bureaux to facilitate outflow, such as Indonesia, the Philippines, Sri Lanka, Korea, Bangladesh, and Thailand. Women remain more dependent than men on the commercial immigration industry, both legal and illegal, and vulnerable to exploitation from it. More effective protection of migrant women is needed. The pre-departure stage is critical, with information needed before the decision to migrate is made. Embassies in host countries should designate and train an officer responsible for migrant women. NGOs need to be involved in pre-departure trainings, networking, information dissemination, and supporting women migrants to form their own networks. International cooperation is needed to better enforce existing regulations on the rights of migrants (adapted from

45. Parrenas, Rhacel Salazar, 2001. *Servants of Globalization: Women, migration and domestic work*, Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Interviews with domestic workers from the Philippines in Rome and Los Angeles are analysed at the following three levels.

Globalisation and the macro-level: Migration is part of the circulation of labour and capital in global capitalism. Economies are denationalised as demand for cheap labour leads to relocation of industries to developing countries, and migration of cheaper labour to developed countries. At the same time, politics are renationalised, in part due to scapegoating of immigrants for unemployment and other problems in developed countries. As a result, immigrants have partial citizenship, being accepted in the economy as low wage workers, but rejected politically. Globalisation involves transnational redistribution of reproductive labour, between race and class, but not between the sexes. Privileged women in developed countries employ women from less privileged countries to do their reproductive labour. These women relegate their reproductive tasks to poorer women in the sending countries.

Gender and transnationalism at the intermediate level: Different communities and institutions respond differently to macro-processes. This can be illuminated by gender and transnational perspectives. Transnationalism explains migrants' daily lives as conducted with reference to multiple connections between sending and receiving contexts. Because they are obstructed from integrating into the host society, migrants turn to transnational institutions such as transnational families and hometown associations. Divergences and power of gender, class and generation in migration also influence the dynamics of migration. Gender is a determinant of migration as sex segregated labour markets create different demands for women's and men's labour, and the institution of gender both constrains women's mobility and motivates migration for women escaping male abuse, the double work day, single motherhood etc. Migration does not, however, succeed in remedying these gender inequalities.

Individual subject level: Experiences and relationships are seen to be determined by one's position in the multiple structures of power e.g. gender, race, class, nation. These create 'dislocations' in migrant workers daily lives, for example partial citizenship, transnational families (maintained across more than one country), downward class mobility (many domestic workers interviewed had college degrees) and social exclusion by both dominant society and migrant communities (e.g. middle class Filipinos looking down on domestic workers). Migrants resist the effects of power structures on themselves, sometimes in ways which reinforce the hierarchies, for instance, domestic workers emphasise their own higher status compared with poorer women back home. This shows the limited power of these migrants. They may resist, in ways which are effective in making themselves feel better, but at the same time intensify the power structures that determine their position in the first place.

46. Sweetman, Caroline, (ed), 1998. 'Gender and migration', *Gender and Development Journal*, Oxfam, UK.

Migration is determined by household or family resources and decision-making structures, the culture of the community and the gender segregated labour markets available. Issues of both reproduction and production need to be considered, to understand migration as part of a livelihood strategy of not just the individual, but

also the family. This means looking at impact on those left behind. An absent man may result in increased decision-making power for women, and/or increased stress, confusion and friction in decision making. Considering those left behind opens new perspectives on the household as multilocational, and as including those who may not be living together, but do maintain economic and emotional links across different locations. Migration has varying impacts on women's and men's power, status and roles. Migration may open possibilities for gender change, as people realise that gender dynamics vary across cultures, rather than being a biological given.

47. Willis, Katie, and Brenda Yeoh (ed), 2000. *Gender and Migration, The international library of studies on migration series*, Cheltenham UK: Edward Elgar Publishing.

This volume draws together articles on gender and migration in North America, Europe, Latin America, Asia and Africa. It highlights new gender insights on migration in relation to employment, gender relations, household organisation, accompanying spouses and those left behind, identity, citizenship, transnationalism and migration policy. The introduction provides an overview on gender and migration. Migration flows are at a record high due to increased demand for women's labour – especially sex and service work - at the same time as rural opportunities are decreasing. In general, women migrants are worse off than men migrants.

The household is identified as an important site, in that household power structures influence decisions to migrate. Households may motivate or constrain migration, with people migrating to join other household members, or being unable to migrate due to domestic responsibilities. Access to reproductive care, for example from grandmothers, may motivate migration.

How far does migration liberate women? Migration itself is described as gendered work, with women doing the work of networking to enable migration and sustain ties to the home community, and with women sometimes being expected to be responsible for continuing to uphold the home culture in the new context. In some cases migration empowers women, in other instances women uphold male power in return for support from men in an unfamiliar environment. Migrating to accompany a spouse has a negative impact on their likelihood to work.

48. Islam, T. 2003. 'Bangladesh: government mulls lifting ban on domestic workers', The Inter Press Service (IPS) News Agency, www.ipsnews.net/migration/stories/ban.html (accessed 19.02.03)

This short news article provides information about the ban on certain categories of female migrants. The Bangladesh government is considering lifting a four year old ban on sending women abroad to work as domestic workers. The ban was imposed in the wake of widespread reports of physical and sexual abuse of domestic workers in Middle East countries, where most of the 3.2 million Bangladeshi migrant workers are found. The government states it first want to be sure that conditions for domestic workers in recipient countries have improved. This is an aim that women's rights activists share. In reality, the ban has actually encouraged the illegal migration of women who then have no protection from abuse and exploitation by traffickers and employees. One suggested solution is multi-lateral protection under the UN that would compel labour-receiving countries to protect the rights of migrant workers.

49. Gardner, K. 1995. *Global Migrants, Local Lives: travel and transformation in rural Bangladesh*, Oxford: Clarendon Press.

Based on 15 months fieldwork in a village in north-east Bangladesh, this book tells of the transformation of local society and the individuals within it, much of which has been brought about through overseas migration to Britain, the Middle East, North America, and the Far East. Men monopolise and control important resources, and migration is no exception. In general either whole families or just men migrate, resulting in a gender imbalance in the community. Overseas migration has transformed the economic and social fabric of the society, sometimes with contradictory effects. Marriage patterns have been affected, for example 'outside' influences have increased the popularity of romantic love. At the same time, the stress on purdah-related behaviour, respectability, and formal Islam has in turn undermined domains in which women traditionally had power. Despite these constraints, some women have increased their power and status. Wealthier women, for example, are better placed than poor women to negotiate and redefine purdah to their advantage. In the absence of men some migrants' wives have been able to enter male domains, albeit covertly.

50. Kabeer, N. 2000. *The Power to Choose. Bangladeshi Women and Labour Market Decisions in London and Dhaka*, London and New York: Verso Press.

Naila Kabeer examines the lives of Bangladeshi garment workers to highlight the question of what constitutes fair competition in international trade. While Bangladesh is generally considered a poor, conservative Muslim country, with a long tradition of female seclusion, women have entered factories to take their place as a prominent first generation labour force. At the same time, in Britain's modern and secular society with its long tradition of female industrial employment, Bangladeshi women are largely concentrated in homebased piecework for the garment industry. This book draws on testimonies from women of both groups concerning their experiences at work and the impact these have on their lives. Kabeer argues that any attempt to devise acceptable labour standards at the international level, taking no account of the forces of inclusion and exclusion within local labour markets, is likely to represent the interests of multinational companies rather than women workers (adapted from IDS website: <http://www.ids.ac.uk/>).

51. Siddiqui, T. 2001. *Transcending Boundaries: labour migration of women from Bangladesh*, Dhaka: The University Press Limited.

In recent times a major structuring of the global economy has taken place. This has resulted in an increase in short-term migration of labour. An important feature of such restructuring is a high demand for female labour. A large number of Bangladeshi women have responded to such demand and joined the labour markets of Middle East and South East Asian countries. Successive governments in Bangladesh have pursued a policy of either restricting or placing a ban on the migration of certain categories of women. Such policies of the government have not, however, stemmed the flow of women from taking up employment beyond the national boundary. On the contrary, they have contributed to irregular migration, and to a large extent, have also made potential women migrants vulnerable to trafficking. Civil society organisations have failed to appreciate women's motivation to migrate and provide them with appropriate services. The author argues that the state, non-governmental and civil society organisations should respect women's right to migrate and play a facilitating role.

52. United Nations International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women (INSTRAW) and International Organization for Migration (IOM) 2000. *Temporary Labour Migration of Women: case studies of Bangladesh and Sri Lanka*, Santa Domingo: INSTRAW.

Official figures on female labour migration from Bangladesh grossly underestimate its magnitude. The government's reluctance to acknowledge the reality of female migration has contributed to its inability to protect the rights of Bangladeshi women migrants. National and international laws pertaining to labour migration have not been properly enforced. The empirical findings of a field study of 200 households show that social factors, such as the need to earn a dowry, or escape unhappy family situations were as much a cause of female migration as economic factors. The migrant women interviewed for this study stayed abroad on average for about three years. Most were subject to harsh working conditions and in some cases to physical and sexual abuse. Domestic aides were particularly at risk to such mistreatment. Economic benefits of migration appear to be mixed, as were social benefits. Sons and daughters were generally married off earlier, girls to ensure they were 'protected' while the mother was away and boys to bring in a woman to keep house. There is little change in gender roles in the family caused by the migration of female members. However, most of the women migrants found that their experiences with migration had an empowering effect. Recommendations include the urgent need to enact a national policy on migrant workers to defend their human rights while abroad. This book also looks at Sri Lanka.

53. Fan CC., Li L. 2002. *Marriage and Migration in transitional China: a field study of Gaozhou, western Guangdong*, *Environmental Planning* 34 (4): 619-638 April.

Marriage and marriage migration are often downplayed in the migration literature. The role of location in decision making and relations between marriage and labour migration are little understood. Research that focuses on international marriages and on Western or capitalist economies has highlighted marriage as a strategy, but little attention has been given to domestic marriage migration in socialist and transitional economies. On the basis of a field study of two villages in western Guangdong, and analysis of quantitative and qualitative data from that study, two arguments are advanced. Firstly, changing inequalities between areas have reinforced the importance of location in the matching and trade-off processes that lead to marriage migration. Secondly, increased opportunities for labour migration – a product of economic transition - have enlarged the peasants' marriage market and at the same time intensified the gender division of labour within marriage. The findings underscore household and individual strategies in response to macro level constraints and opportunities, the centrality of marriage for understanding migration, and the relations between marriage and labour migration (adapted from Web of Science).

54. Huang, Y. 2001. 'Gender, hukou, and the occupational attainment of female migrants in China (1985–1990)', *Environment and Planning*, 33 (2): 257–279, February.

The occupational attainment of female migrants in China has to be understood in its unique socio-cultural and institutional context. In addition to the constraints of human capital, patriarchal culture and the Household Registration (hukou) System

greatly constrain the occupational attainment of female migrants. An empirical study based on a 1% sample of China's 1990 census shows that female migrants are at a disadvantage not only because of gender discrimination, but also because of their rural identities and outsider status, as defined by the hukou system. They can only attain jobs with lower prestige than their male counterparts, such as agricultural work and a few gender-stereotyped, family-related urban jobs (adapted from Web of Science).

55. Li Yinhe, Tan Shen, Tang Can, Feng Xiaoshuang, Guo Zhenglin, Qu Ningdeng (China Academy of Social Sciences Rural Women Economic Migration theme group), 2000. *Peasant Mobility and Gender*, Central Plains Peasant Publishing House (in Chinese).

An analysis of the 1990 population survey shows of those who moved for marriage, 91.4% were women, and 8.6% were men. Of those who had moved for work, 70% were men and 30% women, but recent data shows the proportion of women is rising. Men are slightly more likely to migrate further to another province. Men tend to migrate to big cities and the richer coastal areas. Women are more concentrated in particular provinces such as Guangdong. Most migrants are under 35. Women migrants are younger and less likely to be married than men migrants. Migrants are more educated than those left behind; women migrants are less educated than men migrants. The labour market is similarly sex segregated for migrants and non-migrants, with men concentrated in construction, women in service industries, and women earning less than men. This sex segregation was reduced after the revolution in 1949, but returned during the 1990s with the economic reforms, due to deep-rooted social and cultural inequalities. Interviews with young women and men migrants in Guangdong showed that many had migrated to earn money and 'see the world'. They hoped for love and marriage and had not ruled out meeting a partner while away from home. However, most still wanted to return home to marry, and women hoped to marry a returnee. Rural areas are still more traditional than urban areas, so when unmarried women return to the countryside to get married, they find it particularly hard to adjust to traditional marriage. Marriage means an end to personal development for many women. Married couples usually give priority to the man to migrate, or migrate first, as migration is seen as a good opportunity.

56. Willis, K. and Yeoh, B. 2002. 'Gendering transnational communities: a comparison of Singaporean and British migrants in China', *Geoforum* 33 (4): 553–565, November.

Studies of transnational communities and transnational labour migration have focused almost exclusively on low-skilled and unskilled workers. While these groups may be numerically dominant, increasing numbers of managers and professionals are engaged in work-related migration in association with the intensification of economic globalisation. Work which has been conducted on highly skilled migrants has largely been limited to examinations of intra-firm mobility and the workspace. This approach fails to consider the ways in which the migrants' experiences are embedded in the social, economic and political practices of the host country, but also in a specific household context. This study addresses that gap. Findings include that single migrants, particularly Singaporean women, often view migration as a form of liberation from the constraints 'at home'. UK women felt more freedom to move around, with less threat to personal safety than in the UK. British working women also generally felt that China's gender equality policies had made the working environment less sexist than in the UK. Men enjoyed unprecedented attention from

local and other women due to their perceived attractiveness and marriageability being enhanced by their expatriate status, while the perceived marriageability of expatriate women decreased (adapted from Web of Science).

57. Yang, XS. and Guo, F. 1999. 'Gender differences in determinants of temporary labour migration in China: A multilevel analysis', *International Migration Review*, 33 (4): 929–953.

Data from a 1988 migration survey in Hubei province are used to examine gender differences in the determinants of temporary labour migration from a multi-level perspective. Community level factors are found to play a key role in temporary labour migration. Models omitting community level variables are poor in predicting temporary labour migration. Significant gender differences exist in determinants of temporary labour migration. For men, temporary migration is mainly a response to community level factors; individual or household characteristics have little predictive power. For women, by contrast, temporary labour migration is predominantly determined by individual characteristics; community level factors are not as important (adapted from Web of Science).

58. Zhang, HXQ 1999. 'Female migration and urban labour markets in Tianjin', *Development and Change* 30, (10): 21–41, January.

The spontaneous, large-scale movement from the countryside to the cities witnessed in China since the early 1980s has drawn increasing attention in academic circles. However, research has tended to focus on quantitative macro-level data collection and interpretation rather than on the experiences of those involved in the migratory process. Using qualitative research methods, experiences of Chinese rural female migrants are presented as narrated by themselves. The major forces behind rural women's out-migration are identified as reduction in bureaucratic obstacles to migration and the continuing rural-urban divide. These factors have contributed to shaping women's lives and experiences in the migratory process. Women are seen to be actors and agents in this unprecedented economic and social transformation. Through their active engagement in the urban labour market, female migrants have challenged both the traditionally defined gender roles and the spatial and socio-economic boundaries that have been imposed upon them. Their actions may catalyse a radical rearrangement of social, political and sexual orders (adapted from Web of Science in consultation with author).

59. Iversen, V. 2000. 'Autonomy in child labour migrants', Discussion Paper # 248, School of Development Studies, University of East Anglia, November.

The idea that children may be active decision-makers has received little serious attention from social scientists. New research on data from rural Karnataka, India, suggests that very young males leave for the city in considerable numbers often in direct conflict with parental preferences. Despite high local incomes and public policies favourable to educational attendance, about one in eight 10-14 year old boys are or have been labour migrants, primarily working in South-Indian food joints in Bangalore city. Girl migrants are fewer in numbers and mainly work as domestic servants. Gender differences in autonomous behaviour are strongly pronounced. While girls are cooperative or obey parental will, boys are more likely to leave home on their own terms, often by running away. Key findings include: 23% of the migrant boys left home against parental wishes but usually retain family links and remit wages; the probability of autonomous migration increases rapidly with age in the

case of boys; boys from lower caste backgrounds are less likely to make autonomous decisions; high incidence of autonomous behaviour in the peer-group increases the probability of autonomy; domestic discord, much of it alcohol-fuelled, has a strong effect on autonomous behaviour (adapted from ID21, <http://www.id21.org>).

60. Kannabiran, K. 1998. 'Mapping migration, gender, culture and politics in the Indian diaspora—Commemorating Indian arrival in Trinidad', *Economic and Political Weekly* Vol. 6, November.

Many Indian women went to Trinidad as already independent women who made a conscious decision to move out of the difficult social situations which confronted them in India. These included deserted women, practising prostitutes and Brahmin widows. Paradoxically, upon arrival they were confronted with Trinidadian ideas of Indianness which equated Indian culture with subordination of women. To some degree, migrant women conformed to these images. At the same time, some have joined Hindu movements in Trinidad in challenging their political exclusion, and the stereotyping of Indian women as passive and oppressed (adapted from Web of Science).

61. Lingam, Lakshmi (ed), 1998. *The Indian Journal of Social Work, Volume 59, Issue 3, Special Issue, Women and Migration*, Mumbai: The Institute of Social Work, July.

The gender dimension and women's experiences are identified as a gap in migration studies. This special issue addresses that gap with an overview of material, selected articles, and an annotated bibliography on women and migration, primarily but not exclusively focussing on India. Themes covered in the overview and bibliography include: internal and international migration, women left behind, women's rural-rural and rural-urban migration, including women's migration for domestic labour and for construction work. Women in rural-rural seasonal migration face extremely exploitative conditions. In urban areas, women migrants are constrained from finding work by their domestic roles and lack of skills. The bibliography includes 39 summaries of materials on migration.

62. Pothukuchi, K. 2001. 'Effectiveness and empowerment in women's shelter: a study of working women's hostels in Bangalore', India, *International Journal Of Urban And Regional Research*, 25 (2): 362–79, June.

Policy debates on shelter for women have focused on family structure, gender roles and the importance of shelter in women's economic development. They emphasize the need for shelter that is generally effective and empowering for women. Although valuable, these general proposals are often unable to account for the particular situations in specific cultural contexts in which family structure, roles and economic development are reshaped by women's migration. Through a study of 12 working women's hostels in Bangalore, India, which includes a survey of 126 residents and four focus groups, this article analyses the functions that hostels serve for women and explores the aspects of hostels that are effective and empowering. While only partially effective and empowering, hostels offer a significant policy opportunity to help migrant women both expand their personal, social, economic and political universe without losing contact with the familiar and nurturing networks of family, and gain autonomy over their shelter and lives. The article discusses how hostels can

provide a stepping stone for policy and programmatic interventions toward decent, secure and empowering shelter for women migrants (adapted from web of science).

63. Srinivasan, S. 1997. 'Breaking rural bonds through migration: the failure of development for women in India', *Journal Of Comparative Family Studies*, spring, Vol. 28, No. 1: 89–102.

Despite many five-year plans specifically focused on rural development, the major focus and most rapid development has been in the cities. Since growth has been biased toward the capital intensive urban centres, the rural poor have no other option but to seek a livelihood in the urban centres resulting in an unparalleled migration and an unprecedented growth of slums. This study focuses on women's lives and opportunities and asks whether their opportunities are affected more by rural development programmes or by migration. Two methods of data collection were used: interviews with the oldest member of every household in a developed village, a less developed village and an urban slum; and interviews with randomly selected women from these areas. The women's narratives revealed that bonds of caste and gender are stronger in rural areas than in urban areas. Development programmes have perpetuated traditional gender and caste roles and thus worsened conditions for women in rural India. Migration to urban areas is inevitable unless rural planners and policy makers make it their first priority to develop policies that break the stranglehold of caste and landholding on the one hand and unequal gender relations on the other. If development is to reach the rural areas and benefit women, planners and policy makers need to promote the autonomy of women in the rural areas and take into account the patriarchal nature of gender relations. The social organisation of women could provide a catalyst for change in rural India (adapted from Web of Science).

64. Balchin, Cassandra (ed), 1996. 'Women in society: Mobility and Rights' in *Women, Law and Society: an action manual for NGOS, Women Living Under Muslim Laws, Women and Law Pakistan Country Project*, Lahore: Shirkat Gah.

This manual provides practical information aiming to advance women's understanding of their entitlements under the sometimes conflicting statutory and customary legal frameworks in Pakistan. The section on Mobility and Rights outlines what statutory and customary laws say on mobility and segregation, the right to work, property and economic rights, and political and religious participation. The constitution guarantees freedom of movement to every citizen. In practice, however, women's mobility, and requirements to observe purdah, depend on the woman's class, age, marital status, specific purpose of travel, and the general customs of the province and ethnic group. For example, in rural areas in Punjab, unmarried women are generally not allowed to travel outside the village, and even within the village can move about only for work, however lower class women are not restricted. Where husbands are migrant labourers, greater mobility for women is generally accepted by in-laws and the community. However, where husbands migrated to the Gulf states in the 1970s and 1980s, observance of purdah increased, probably as the marker of increased social status. Forms of purdah never before seen in Pakistan, including Saudi and Iranian style veils, are now visible in urban areas.

65. Donnan, Hastings and Werbner, Pnina (ed), 1991. *Economy and culture in Pakistan: migrants and cities in a Muslim society*, London: Macmillan Academic and Professional.

Migration within Pakistan, and overseas to the UK or Middle East, has brought about social changes in many parts of Punjab. Long-term male absences have sometimes allowed wives greater decision-making power regarding land, children's education and household finances. Evidence suggests these powers do not revert back to the male upon his return. Ironically, for many daughters of such families, the increased purchasing power has led to inflated dowries, withdrawal from agriculture and increasing seclusion. Men returning from migration faced problems not only of economic integration, but also social and cultural readjustment. This dislocation has popularly been termed the 'Dubai syndrome', referring to a range of sexual, guilt and depressive symptoms which can afflict migrants and their families throughout the migration process.

66. Lefebvre, Alain 1990. 'International labour migration from two Pakistani villages with different forms of agriculture', *The Pakistani Development Review*, 29:1, Spring: 59–90.

A socio-economic analysis is made of two Pakistani villages in an attempt to explain the effect of migration on village society. The efforts are described of male migrants to maintain seclusion of, and avoid handing over control to, female household members, for example by transferring responsibility for cultivation to a male relative before departure, and sending remittances to the head of the extended family, rather than to the wife herself. Seclusion is generally increased by male international out-migration which provides greater economic possibilities for maintaining purdah (adapted from article abstract).

67. Wheeler, Erica L. 1998. 'Mental Illness and social stigma: experiences in a Pakistani community in the UK', in *Gender and Development*, Vol. 6, No. 1, March.

Qualitative interviews and focus group discussions with migrant women from Pakistan and first generation Britons discharged from in-patient psychiatric care illustrate the unintended and adverse consequences of this care. There are no direct translations of psychiatric terms such as depression into Urdu/Punjabi or Mirpuri, and the distinction between illnesses of the body and the mind is made less sharply in traditional Asian healing than in western medicine. Interviewees described the label 'mentally ill' being translated as 'pagal' (literally 'mad'), and their being met with misunderstanding and stigma from their families and the Pakistani community. They identify family problems, traumas and conflicts, lack of support, as well as stresses of separation brought about by migration, as having caused their health problems. Hospitalisation further complicates family situations, losing them respect from their children, involvement in family decisionmaking, and support and recognition from the extended family. Facilities need to be provided in mother tongue languages, avoiding the label 'mental' health services, and which provide both counselling support and teaching of practical skills to make them acceptable to Pakistani users. Home-based care, which removing the stigmatisation of hospital, is also recommended.

68. Dang Nguyen Anh, 2000. 'Women's migration and urban integration in the context of Doi Moi', *Vietnam's Socio-Economic Development, A quarterly review* –No. 23, Autumn.

The Doi Moi economic reforms introduced in 1986 allowed for a relaxation of restrictions on the household registration system which obstructed rural-urban migration. The system no longer limits acquisition of essential goods in cities. However it still restricts migrants' participation in the housing, credit, business and land market. Social services such as health care and schooling are also limited for migrants without permanent registration. This creates a major division between temporary migrants and those with permanent registration. During the Doi Moi periods, large numbers of young women moved to urban areas for economic reasons as temporary migrants. Permanent women migrants were more likely to have moved for marriage or family reasons. Finding work and escaping urban poverty was easiest for women who were single, migrated at an older age, had moved to towns rather than cities, and who were well connected with migrant networks. Middle level education was an advantage in finding work, but a university or college degree increased the chances of unemployment among migrants. To increase the success of Doi Moi, policy efforts are recommended which accommodate migration, and treat population redistribution as a positive factor for development. These conclusions are drawn from interviews with over 2,500 individuals in migrant and non-migrant households in six provinces and cities throughout Vietnam.

69. Truong Si Anh, Patrick Gubry, Vu Thi Hong and Jerrold Huguet, 1996. 'Migration and Employment in Ho Chi Minh City', *Asia Pacific Population Journal*, Vol. 11, No. 2, June.

The Doi Moi reforms, meaning literally 'renovation', allowed for relaxation of registration, employment opportunities in the private sector, and the possibility of self-employment. Similar to reforms in China, these have resulted in an upsurge of spontaneous migration in contrast to previous population moves that were either government organised or sponsored. Evidence from household and individual questionnaires carried out in 1994 is used to explore these migration dynamics. However, the sampling method tends to omit temporary migrants, or those without residence permits, so the findings reflect the situation of registered more than unregistered migrants. Migration flows to Ho Chi Minh City after 1989 are more concentrated in the ages 15–29 and have a greater proportion of females than previously, with more migrating for economic reasons. Most recent migrants are single, and more have moved for schooling. However, the proportion of females moving for economic reasons is increasing, with greater opportunities as household servants, in light manufacturing, sales and services. Males are more likely than females to move for economic reasons and to work in the private sector. Migrants work longer hours than non-migrants with greater discrepancy between migrant and non-migrant women. Women migrants work longer hours than men migrants. Men migrants earn more than women migrants, but the difference is decreasing. The prevalence of young women among migrants suggests local government should ensure access to health care, particularly reproductive health, for the migrant population.

70. Kibria, Nazli, 'Power, Patriarchy, and Gender Conflict in the Vietnamese Immigrant Community' in Willis, Katie, and Yeoh, Brenda, *Gender and Migration*, 2000. UK. and USA: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.

An ethnographic study of women's social groups and networks in a community of Vietnamese immigrants recently settled in the USA provides the basis for an exploration of migration's effects on gender roles and power. The women's groups and networks play an important role in the exchange of social and economic resources among households, and in the mediation of disputes between men and women in the family. These community forms are an important source of informal power for women, enabling them to cope effectively with male authority in the family. Yet despite their increased power and economic resources, these women supported a patriarchal social structure because it preserved their parental authority and promised greater economic security in the future (adapted from article abstract).

71. Summerfield, G. 1997. 'The Economic transition in China and Vietnam: Crossing the poverty line is just the first step for women and their families', *Review of Social Economy*, Vol. 55, No. 2: 201–214.

A comparison of changing strategies of women and their families during the economic transition in China and Vietnam. Employment strategies to improve the family's well-being have resulted in increased ruralurban migration by men and young women, while middle-aged, married women remain in the countryside taking care of farms and children. Although women have been able to take advantage of new opportunities for employment in non-state firms and their own entrepreneurial endeavours, their employment strategies are limited by increasing discrimination in hiring and layoffs. This mix of factors affects bargaining power between family members, including over decisions about education and health care (adapted from article abstract).